

There is a NEED to Consider:	EFFECTIVENESS in addressing the NEEDS & WHY?		
	OPTION 1 Do Nothing	OPTION 3 ReUse Arena & Site Development	OPTION 5 Demolish Arena & Site Development
I. DESIGN, PLANNING & SUSTAINABILITY			
A. Compatibility with Community Assets	LOW EFFECTIVENESS – Only parking lots would be compatible.	HIGH EFFECTIVENESS – Edges of mixed-use development compatible with adjacent community assets.	HIGH EFFECTIVENESS – Edges of mixed-use development compatible with adjacent community assets.
B. Harmony w/ Surrounding Community - Land Use - Scale Transition between Hill & City	LOW EFFECTIVENESS – No change from existing condition.	HIGH EFFECTIVENESS – Transition in residential use from Hill to commercial/office towards City. – Transition in scale with lower buildings at the Hill to taller buildings towards City.	HIGH EFFECTIVENESS – Transition in residential use from Hill to commercial/office towards City. – Transition in scale with lower buildings at the Hill to taller buildings towards City.
C. Historic Community Fabric - Street Network - Urbanism	LOW EFFECTIVENESS – No change from existing condition.	MODERATE EFFECTIVENESS – Lemieux Place as only interior street connection between Bedford & Centre Aves. – Wylie Ave extended as pedestrian corridor. – Webster Ave extended, but does not connect with Lemieux Place. – Fulton Ave on parking deck discontinuous due to Wylie pedestrian corridor.	HIGH EFFECTIVENESS – Street grid established with 3 N/S through-streets and 1 E/W through-street. – Wylie Ave extended through site for auto & pedestrian usage. – Fulton Ave continuous between Bedford & Centre Aves. – Restores street grid & pre-Arena fabric to extent practicable.
D. Urban Design - Constructability - Density/Massing/Access/Scale (DMAS)	LOW EFFECTIVENESS – No change from existing condition.	MODERATE-HIGH EFFECTIVENESS – Constrained construction site due to Arena. Benching required to adjust the grade between Crawford Ave & Arena. – Ventilation needed for larger closed parking garages. – Tree survival on top of parking garage is problematic. – Existing Arena presents development scale challenges. – (DMAS) congested feel of Crawford Overlook, Arena & adjacent buildings – Arena as a focal urban design element. – Easier to construct because there is less development.	HIGH EFFECTIVENESS – Unconstrained construction site without Arena. Benching not required. – More traditional construction. – (DMAS) Street grid and more urban blocks. – Street grid, traditional blocks & trees along streets as urban design elements. – More difficult to construct because there is more development. – Without the Arena, development scale can be more flexible. – Barriers to construction are removed.
E. Green (Environmental & Economic) - Short-term / Long-term - Public Green / Open Space	LOW EFFECTIVENESS – No change from existing condition.	MODERATE-HIGH EFFECTIVENESS – Embodied energy short-term advantage of Arena reuse. – Purposed open space in and around Arena. – New development would be LEED-based for long-term efficiency	MODERATE EFFECTIVENESS – Short-term material recycling of demolished Arena. – Purposed & passive public green & open space along edges and pedestrian corridors. – Arena demolition loses embodied energy and short-term efficiency – New development would be LEED-based for long-term efficiency
F. Historic Resource - Effect on Resource (anticipated)	No Adverse Effect to Arena – No change from existing condition.	Minimized Adverse Effect to Arena – Preserves the Arena in a repurposed condition.	Adverse Effect to Arena – Removes the Arena.
II. COMMUNITY COHESION & CONNECTIVITY			
A. Physical Barriers - Hill to Downtown - Downtown to Hill - Within Redevelopment	LOW EFFECTIVENESS – Arena site remains a barrier.	LOW-MODERATE EFFECTIVENESS – A partial street grid to be established – Pedestrian Wylie Steps link Crawford Ave with Lemieux Place. – Fulton/Webster Aves on top of garage do not connected with Lemieux Place.	HIGH EFFECTIVENESS – The street grid best removes physical barriers and provides more flexibility.
B. Visual Barriers - Between Hill & Downtown - Within Development	LOW EFFECTIVENESS – No change from existing condition.	MODERATE EFFECTIVENESS – Views from/of Crawford Overlook. – Arena as a focal urban design element.	MODERATE EFFECTIVENESS – Open views along linear street corridors. – Visual barrier of Arena removed.
C. Pedestrian & Transit Connections - Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) Compliance - Enhanced Connection Opportunities	LOW EFFECTIVENESS – No change from existing condition.	MODERATE EFFECTIVENESS – Pedestrian Wylie Ave not ADA compliant. Elevators required at Crawford Overlook. – Transit & pedestrian opportunities.	MODERATE-HIGH EFFECTIVENESS – Streets ADA compliant with greater potential for ADA participation throughout site. – Transit & pedestrian opportunities.