

## Draft Determination of Effects Report - Summary

### Relationship of Proposed Action to Historic Resource and Assessment of Project Effect

#### ***Option 1 – Do Nothing:***

This option involves closing or “mothballing” Mellon Arena. The arena would remain unused indefinitely. Minimal maintenance would be performed to keep the building from becoming derelict. Under this option, the parking lots would be maintained and operated in support of the Consol Energy Center. Because Option 1 does not involve any physical alteration to Mellon Arena or its surrounding land, this alternative has no potential to alter, directly or indirectly, characteristics of the historic resource such as design, materials, workmanship, setting, feeling, and association that qualify it for the NRHP (Table 1).

#### ***Option 3 – Arena Reuse and Site Development:***

Because Option 3 involves the partial demolition and substantial reconfiguration of Mellon Arena, the proposed project has the potential to alter, directly or indirectly, characteristics of the historic resource such as design, materials, workmanship, setting, feeling, and association that qualify it for the NRHP (Table 1).

#### ***Option 5 – Arena Demolition & Site Development:***

Because Option 5 involves the demolition and removal of Mellon Arena, the proposed project has the potential to alter, directly or indirectly, characteristics of the historic resource such as design, materials, workmanship, setting, feeling, and association that qualify it for the NRHP (Table 1).

**TABLE 1: RESULTS OF EFFECT EVALUATION FOR MELLON ARENA, OPTIONS 1, 3, 5**

DEFINITION OF EFFECT	OPTION 1 (Do Nothing)	OPTION 3 (Arena ReUse)	OPTION 5 (Arena Demo)
An effect may occur when there is alteration to the characteristics of a historic property qualifying it for inclusion in or eligible for the National Register as defined in Section 800.16(l).	The undertaking will not have any direct or indirect effects on the arena or its surroundings.	The undertaking will directly alter the design and integrity of Mellon Area and proposed redevelopment will cause a substantial change in the character and use of adjacent land.	The undertaking will result in the destruction and removal of Mellon Arena
FINDING	<b><i>Historic Property Not Affected</i></b>	<b><i>Historic Property Affected</i></b>	<b><i>Historic Property Affected</i></b>

## Application of the Criteria of Adverse Effect

### ***Option 3 – Arena ReUse & Site Development***

As the proposed undertaking will affect Mellon Arena, the following discussion applies the Criteria of Adverse Effect on the historic resource in accordance with the regulations of 36 CFR 800.5(a)(1).

Under Option 3, the proposed undertaking will result in the demolition arena's seating bowl. The building's signature metal retractable dome would remain operable, and the building shell would shelter flexible open space and a new hotel. This option would preserve the dome, from which the building's engineering significance is primarily derived. The building's interior would be substantially altered by the removal of the seating bowl. The building would no longer be capable of performing its historic function as an arena. Therefore, Option 3 constitutes an adverse effect to Mellon Arena, although that effect would be minimized by the retention of the building's dome and support structure. To further clarify this finding of **HISTORIC PROPERTIES ADVERSELY AFFECTED**, Table 2 evaluates the potential for examples of adverse effects specified in 36 CFR 800.5(a)(2).

### ***Option 5 – Arena Demolition & Site Redevelopment***

As the proposed undertaking will affect Mellon Arena, the following discussion applies the Criteria of Adverse Effect on the historic resource in accordance with the regulations of 36 CFR 800.5(a)(1).

Under the preferred alternative, the proposed project involves the demolition and removal of Mellon Arena and the redevelopment of the former arena site and adjacent parking areas with a mix of modern commercial and residential buildings. The undertaking will also remove the resource from its historic location. Therefore, Development Option 5 constitutes an adverse effect to Mellon Arena. To further clarify this finding of **HISTORIC PROPERTIES ADVERSELY AFFECTED**, Table 2 evaluates the potential for examples of adverse effects specified in 36 CFR 800.5(a)(2).

**TABLE 2: APPLICATION OF THE CRITERIA OF ADVERSE EFFECT**

An adverse effect is found when an undertaking may alter, directly or indirectly, any characteristics of a historic property that qualify the property for inclusion in the National Register in a manner that would diminish the integrity of the property's location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, or association. Consideration shall be given to all qualifying characteristics of a historic property, including those that may have been identified subsequent to the original evaluation of the property's eligibility for the National Register. Adverse effects may include reasonably foreseeable effects caused by the undertaking that may occur later in time, be farther removed in distance or be cumulative.

<p><b>Examples of Adverse Effects, pursuant to Section 800.5(a)(2)</b> <i>Adverse effects on historic properties include, but are not limited to:</i></p>	<p><b>Option 3 (Arena ReUse)</b></p>	<p><b>Option 5 (Arena Demo)</b></p>
<p><b>(i) Physical destruction of or damage to all or part of the property;</b></p>	<p>Physical destruction of part of the resource will occur.</p>	<p>The proposed project will result in the physical destruction of all of the resource.</p>
<p><b>(ii) Alteration of a property, including restoration, rehabilitation, repair, maintenance, stabilization, hazardous material remediation and provision of handicapped access, that is not consistent with the Secretary's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (36 CFR§68) and applicable guidelines;</b></p>	<p>The proposed project will alter the historic property in ways that do not comply with the Secretary's Standards. The seating bowl and all interior features will be removed. The interior will reconstructed flexible open space.</p>	<p>The proposed project will not alter the historic property in any of the indicated methods—it will be demolished.</p>
<p><b>(iii) Removal of the property from its historic location;</b></p>	<p>The property will remain at its historic location.</p>	<p>The proposed project will remove the property from its historic location.</p>
<p><b>(iv) Change of the character of the property's use or of physical features within the property's setting that contribute to its historic significance;</b></p>	<p>The property will no longer be able to perform its historic function as an arena. The seating area, which is a character-defining feature of an arena, will be demolished.</p>	<p>The proposed project will change the character of the property's use and physical features within the property's setting that contribute to its historic significance through the demolition of the historic resource.</p>
<p><b>(v) Introduction of visual, atmospheric, or audible elements that diminish the integrity of the property's significant historic features;</b></p>	<p>The proposed construction of a modern hotel under the arena dome will introduce a modern visual element that is out of character with the historic function of the property. In addition, the mixed-use redevelopment of the land surrounding the arena will cause substantial visual and atmospheric changes in the setting of the arena, which was historically surrounded by large surface parking lots.</p>	<p>The proposed project will not introduce visual, atmospheric, or audible elements that diminish the resource's integrity—the resource will be demolished.</p>
<p><b>(vi) Neglect of a property which causes its deterioration, except where such neglect and deterioration are recognized qualities of a property of religious and cultural significance to an Indian tribe or Native Hawaiian organization; and</b></p>	<p>The proposed project will not cause neglect of the property resulting in its deterioration.</p>	<p>The proposed project will not cause neglect of the property resulting in its deterioration.</p>
<p><b>(vii) Transfer, lease, or sale of property out of Federal ownership or control without adequate and enforceable restrictions or conditions to ensure long-term preservation of the property's historic significance.</b></p>	<p>The property is not under Federal ownership or control.</p>	<p>The property is not under Federal ownership or control.</p>
<p><b>Finding</b></p>	<p><b>Adverse Effect</b></p>	<p><b>Adverse Effect</b></p>